

October 7, 2022

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

The Honorable Paul A. Engelmayer
United States District Court
Southern District of New York
40 Foley Square, Room 2201
New York, New York 10007

Re: *Goldstein et al. v. Professional Staff Congress/CUNY et al.*,
Case No. 1:22-cv-00321-PAE

Dear Judge Engelmayer:

This joint letter addresses the status of the claims in Count 3 of the Complaint, as required by the Court's order of September 28, 2022, ECF No. 70.

Three plaintiffs brought claims for prospective and damages relief under Count 3. The plaintiffs have conceded that any prospective relief under this Count, and thus any claim against the State Defendants under this Count, is no longer justiciable. (No damages relief was sought by any plaintiff against State Defendants under Count 3.)

Three plaintiffs have the following claim for retroactive relief in the form of money damages (along with interest, attorneys' fees, and costs) against the following defendants:

- (1) Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein's claim for damages against Defendant PSC and Defendant City of New York under Count 3

On April 22, 2022, Defendant City of New York only (not Defendant PSC) made a Rule 68 Offer of Judgment to Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein. On May 6, 2022, Plaintiff Goldstein accepted Defendant City's Rule 68 Offer of Judgment. Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein and Defendant City have been negotiating appropriate attorneys' fees, expenses, and costs. The parties will continue to negotiate, and at oral argument on October 26, 2022, Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein will advise the Court whether a fee application is necessary. Judgment has not yet been entered on the Rule 68 Offer. Once the clerk enters judgment on the Rule 68 Offer of Judgment to Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein and the City pays Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein what it owes on that entered judgment, Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein will not pursue any further claim against the PSC under Count 3. Until the clerk enters judgment on the Rule 68 Offer of Judgment to Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein and the City pays Plaintiff Avraham Goldstein what it owes on that entered judgment, he has a Count 3 claim for money damages against Defendant PSC for dues and/or interest that he alleges were deducted from his wages after the date of his resignation from union membership, along with attorneys' fees and costs.

(2) Plaintiff Frimette Kass-Shraibman's and Plaintiff Mitchell Langbert's claims for damages against Defendant PSC under Count 3

Plaintiffs Kass-Shraibman and Langbert have live claims for money damages against Defendant PSC for dues and/or interest that they alleged were deducted from their wages after the date of their resignation from union membership.

There are no outstanding claims against State Defendants under Count 3.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Nathan J. McGrath

Nathan J. McGrath (*pro hac vice*)

Email: njmcgrath@fairnesscenter.org

Danielle R. Acker Susanj (*pro hac vice*)

Email: drasusanj@fairnesscenter.org

THE FAIRNESS CENTER

500 North Third Street, Suite 600B

Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101

Telephone: 844.293.1001

Facsimile: 717.307.3424

Milton L. Chappell (*pro hac vice*)

Email: mlc@nrtw.org

William L. Messenger (*pro hac vice*)

Email: wlm@nrtw.org

c/o National Right to Work Legal

Defense Foundation, Inc.

8001 Braddock Road, Suite 600

Springfield, Virginia 22160

Telephone: 703.321.8510

Facsimile: 703.321.9319

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

s/ Hanan B. Kolko

Hanan B. Kolko

COHEN, WEISS AND SIMON LLP

900 Third Avenue, Suite 2100

New York, New York 10022-4869

Telephone: (212) 356-0214

hkolko@cwsny.com

*Counsel for Defendant, The Professional Staff
Congress/CUNY*

s/ John F. Walpole

John F. Walpole
Assistant Corporation Counsel
100 Church Street, Room 2-187
New York, NY 10007 (212) 356-2470
jwalpole@law.nyc.gov

Attorney for Defendant City of New York

s/ Jonathan A. Siegel

Jonathan A. Siegel, Assistant Attorney
General
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005
Tel. (212) 416-8888
Jonathan.Siegel@ag.ny.gov

Attorney for State Defendants

The Court appreciates this update from the parties.

SO ORDERED.



PAUL A. ENGELMAYER
United States District Judge
October 11, 2022